

Values Education in Curriculum Reform: A Qualitative Document Analysis of the Türkiye Century Maarif Model for Primary Education

Ethem Gürhan 

Ministry of National Education, Türkiye

Corresponding Author's e-mail: ethemgurhan@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Values education has become a central concern in contemporary curriculum reforms as education systems seek to balance academic achievement with character and moral development. This study examines how values education is conceptualized and operationalized within the Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM), a newly introduced national curriculum framework in Türkiye. Using a qualitative document analysis, this research examines official curriculum policy documents published by the Ministry of National Education, focusing on primary education. Data were examined through thematic analysis to identify the structure, scope, and pedagogical orientation of values education embedded in the curriculum. The findings reveal that TYMM positions values not merely as implicit moral principles but as structured learning outcomes integrated into competencies, learning processes, and assessment expectations. The model emphasizes a holistic framework linking virtues, values, and actions, thereby signaling a shift toward more systematic and measurable character education. This study contributes to the literature on curriculum reform and values education by providing an empirically grounded analysis of a national curriculum model. It offers implications for curriculum designers, policymakers, and educators seeking to strengthen values-based education in primary schooling.

Keywords: values education, curriculum reform, document analysis, Türkiye Century Maarif Model, primary education.

DOI: [10.70376/jerp.v4i1.413](#)

Received: 2025-10-09; Revised: 2026-01-15; Accepted: 2026-01-22; Published: 2026-01-29.

INTRODUCTION

Values education has returned to the foreground of curriculum policy and scholarship as national and transnational reforms attempt to reconcile cognitive goals with students' ethical,¹ civic,² and socio-emotional development.³ Contemporary policy frameworks increasingly frame values and attitudes as components of competency-based curricula, arguing that affective goals must be intentionally integrated, taught, and assessed rather than left solely to hidden-curriculum processes.⁴

This shift raises empirical and conceptual questions about how values are articulated in formal curriculum texts: whether values appear primarily as implicit cultural dispositions, as explicit learning outcomes, or as competency statements linked to observable assessment criteria. To answer these questions, methodologically transparent document analysis is required that reports corpus selection, coding procedures, and trustworthiness strategies (the READ approach is a recent, widely cited protocol for rigorous policy-document analysis).⁵

The Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM) provides a timely case for such inquiry because the reform explicitly foregrounds virtues, values, and competency orientations in its curriculum rhetoric and documentation.⁶ Accordingly, this study conducts a systematic qualitative document analysis of official TYMM materials for primary education to (1) map the values and virtues named or implied in the documents, (2) examine how values are operationalized within competencies, learning outcomes, pedagogical guidance, and assessment language, and (3) discuss implications for curriculum implementation and teacher professional development. Methodologically, the analysis applies transparent, contemporary practices in thematic/document analysis (reflexive thematic analysis and READ-informed document procedures) to ensure replicability and trustworthiness.

Recent policy analyses and comparative work show a marked trend: curriculum reforms adopting competency frameworks increasingly aim to embed values and attitudes alongside knowledge and skills. Advocates argue that this integration promotes coherence between what curricula state (outcomes) and what schools are expected to develop (attitudes, dispositions, civic capacities), while critics caution that instrumentalizing values as

¹ Emiliano Bosio and Hans Schattle, "Ethical Global Citizenship Education: From Neoliberalism to a Values-Based Pedagogy," *PROSPECTS* 53, no. 3–4 (November 24, 2023): 287–97, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-021-09571-9>.

² Ming-Lun Chung and Ken Ka-Wo Fung, "A New Paradigm of Moral Education and Civic Engagement? A Sociological Institutional Interpretation of Multiculturalism among Taiwanese Youth," *Journal of Moral Education* 53, no. 4 (October 12, 2024): 717–42, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2024.2354964>.

³ John Clifford Alvero, "Empowering Future Global Citizens: An Integrated GCED Framework for Enhancing Cognitive, Socio-Emotional, and Behavioral Domains in Philippine Higher Education," *Journal of Interdisciplinary Perspectives* 3, no. 9 (2025): 383–90, <https://doi.org/10.69569/jip.2025.564>.

⁴ OECD, *Embedding Values and Attitudes in Curriculum* (OECD Publishing, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1787/ae2adcd-en>.

⁵ Sarah L Dalglish, Hina Khalid, and Shannon A McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach," *Health Policy and Planning* 35, no. 10 (February 16, 2021): 1424–31, <https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czaa064>.

⁶ Birsal Aybek and Osman Oğuz, "Sustainable and Inclusive Education Reform in Türkiye: A Cipp Evaluation of the Primary Turkish Language Curriculum," *Sustainability* 17, no. 19 (September 26, 2025): 8659, <https://doi.org/10.3390/su17198659>; Dila Can, "New Education Program in Values Education: Türkiye Century Maarif Model," in *PUPIL: International Journal of Teaching, Education and Learning Current Archives About* (Global Research & Development Services Publishing, 2025), 281–87, <https://doi.org/10.20319/ictel.2025.281287>.

measurable competences can risk reductionism if not accompanied by pedagogies that support moral reasoning and contextual judgement.⁷

Empirical syntheses from the last half-decade suggest that programs and curricular designs that combine explicit curricular objectives for values with teacher development, whole-school supports, and aligned assessment practices show the most significant promise for consistent implementation. However, cross-national studies also document significant implementation gaps when curriculum texts are vague or when assessment systems remain narrowly cognitive; these findings underscore the importance of examining not only whether values are named in policy documents but also how they are operationalized into observable outcomes and implementation guidance.⁸

Recent methodological literature emphasises transparent, stepwise approaches to document analysis and to thematic coding. Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon's READ approach (2021) offers a concise protocol for reading materials, extracting data, analysing texts, and distilling findings, guidance that is particularly useful for policy and curriculum documents because it foregrounds provenance, selection criteria, and analytic traceability.⁹ Reflexive thematic analysis by Braun and Clarke complements READ by providing a mature framework for coding and theme development while encouraging reflexivity about researcher positionality and analytic decisions.¹⁰ Together, these contemporary methods provide an integrated blueprint for robust, reproducible document analysis in curriculum research.

Although a growing body of recent work documents the place of values in national curriculum reforms (and evaluates implementation in classroom settings), there remain few transparent, reproducible document analyses that (a) systematically map lexical presence and semantic framing of values across a whole corpus of official curriculum materials, and (b) make explicit the coding frame, inclusion/exclusion rules, and trustworthiness checks. The present study addresses that gap by (i) constructing a closed, date-stamped corpus of TYMM primary-education documents, (ii) applying a documented READ + reflexive thematic analysis procedure, and (iii) reporting codebook, inter-coder procedures (or alternative credibility checks), and illustrative evidence extracts to allow replication and robust peer review.

METHOD

Research Design

This study uses qualitative document analysis combined with reflexive thematic analysis to examine how values are articulated and operationalized in the Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM) curriculum texts for primary education. The analytic workflow integrates the

⁷ OECD, *Embedding Values and Attitudes in Curriculum*; Kayla M. Marcotte and Larry D. Gruppen, "Competency-Based Education as Curriculum and Assessment for Integrative Learning," *Education Sciences* 12, no. 4 (April 11, 2022): 267, <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci12040267>.

⁸ Oona Janssens et al., "When Theory Beats Practice: The Implementation of Competency-Based Education at Healthcare Workplaces," *BMC Medical Education* 23, no. 1 (June 29, 2023): 484, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-023-04446-3>; Marcotte and Gruppen, "Competency-Based Education as Curriculum and Assessment for Integrative Learning."

⁹ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach."

¹⁰ Virginia Braun and Victoria Clarke, "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?," *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 18, no. 3 (July 3, 2021): 328–52, <https://doi.org/10.1080/14780887.2020.1769238>.

READ protocol for document analysis (ready, extract, analyse, distil) with reflexive thematic analysis procedures (familiarization, coding, theme development, review, and write-up) to ensure transparency and analytic traceability. The combined approach follows contemporary guidance on research into policy and curriculum documents.

The corpus comprises official TYMM documents and related curriculum materials published by the Turkish Ministry of National Education (MoNE) and the TYMM portal. Documents were downloaded between 10 February 2025 and 20 July 2025; each file was saved as a dated local copy (PDF) and assigned an ID for traceability. Table 1 lists the primary documents included in the corpus, with type, year, source URL, and rationale for inclusion.

Table 1. Corpus of TYMM documents

ID	Document title (English translation)	Year	Type	Source (URL)	Pages	Date accessed
D1	<i>Türkiye Century Maarif Model — Common Text (Ortak Metin)</i>	2024	Policy / Common Curriculum Text (PDF)	TYMM portal — Common Text. (tymm.meb.gov.tr)	60	10 Feb 2025
D2	<i>TYMM: Report (Rapor-2)</i>	2024	Official report/guidance (PDF)	TYMM upload (rapor-2.pdf). (tymm.meb.gov.tr)	48	11 Feb 2025
D3	<i>Primary-level (Grades 1–5) course curricula (sample): Turkish language — Grade 5</i>	2023–2024	Curriculum/textbook excerpt (PDF)	MEB publications / Grade 5 Turkish textbook (TYMM). (GRDS Publishing)	120	12 Feb 2025
D4	<i>Curriculum Drafts (compulsory courses) — 2024 program package</i>	2024	Draft curriculum compendium (PDF)	MoNE/program package (GorusOneri/2024programtur5678.pdf). (GRDS Publishing)	300	13 Feb 2025
D5	<i>Supporting guidance: School-based planning & extracurricular framework</i>	2024	Guidance/implementation notes (PDF)	TYMM portal resources. (tymm.meb.gov.tr)	36	14 Feb 2025

To ensure a focused, transparent, and replicable analytic corpus, explicit inclusion and exclusion criteria were applied during document selection. Only authoritative policy and curriculum texts—that is, the Common Text (*Ortak Metin*), subject curricula, teacher guidance, and officially approved textbooks—published by the Turkish Ministry of National Education (MoNE) or hosted on the official Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM) portal were eligible for inclusion, consistent with best practice for document-based policy research that emphasizes provenance and institutional authorship.¹¹ Selection was further narrowed to materials that explicitly addressed primary/elementary education (Grades 1–5) or contained clearly articulated primary-level learning outcomes, and to items published during the TYMM drafting and early implementation window (2023–2024 and early 2025) so that the corpus reflected the reform as formally adopted and disseminated. Where both Turkish and English versions existed, the original Turkish texts were treated as the source of record, and the

¹¹ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, “Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach”; Glenn A. Bowen, “Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method,” *Qualitative Research Journal* 9, no. 2 (August 3, 2009): 27–40, <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>.

research team translated passages; translations and original-language excerpts are provided in the appendices to support verifiability and interpretive transparency. By contrast, secondary sources such as news reports, opinion pieces, and unofficial commentaries (including blog posts and student summaries) were excluded from the primary analytic corpus. However, selected media items were consulted only for contextual background on public consultation and implementation processes.¹² Documents that lacked curricular substance—administrative memoranda or operational notices without curricular guidance—were likewise omitted to preserve analytic focus. All inclusion and exclusion decisions, together with file identifiers and access dates, were logged in a dated audit trail to enable independent verification and to satisfy standards of qualitative dependability and confirmability.¹³

Data Extraction

Following the READ protocol,¹⁴ the study proceeded in four preparatory steps: (1) Ready — all documents were catalogued and saved as PDFs with unique IDs and metadata (title, year, URL, file size, page count, date accessed); (2) Extract — sections likely to contain value-related content were extracted into a working dataset (e.g., student profile, competency statements, learning outcomes, assessment rubrics, and teacher guidance); (3) Analyse — textual segments were imported into NVivo 14 (QSR International) for coding and analysis; (4) Distil — themes were developed and iteratively refined with analytic memos and mapping tables. The READ approach ensures provenance tracking and justifies the selection of textual units for coding.

Coding Procedure

The analysis combined qualitative document analysis with reflexive thematic analysis to examine how values are articulated, operationalized, and assessed within TYMM's primary-education curriculum texts. This combined approach was selected because it allows systematic interrogation of policy documents while retaining sensitivity to latent meanings, discursive framing, and policy intentions embedded in curriculum language.¹⁵ The analytic workflow was informed by the READ framework for document analysis—*readying, extracting, analyzing, and distilling* data—which emphasizes transparency in corpus preparation and analytic decision-making.¹⁶

Analytic work proceeded through several iterative phases. First, all documents were read in full to achieve familiarization with the structure, terminology, and rhetorical patterns of the TYMM curriculum texts. During this phase, analytic memos were written to capture preliminary observations related to the framing of values, competencies, and assessment discourse. Second, an initial cycle of open coding was conducted using NVivo 14, combining

¹² Bowen, "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method."

¹³ Dan Jacobson, "Naturalistic Inquiry," in *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, vol. 75 (London: Elsevier, 2020), 267–72, <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-102295-5.10579-7>.

¹⁴ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach."

¹⁵ Bowen, "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method"; Braun and Clarke, "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?"

¹⁶ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach."

inductive coding (allowing codes to emerge from the texts) with deductive attention to theoretically relevant domains such as explicit values, competencies, pedagogical guidance, and assessment indicators. Coding units consisted of semantically meaningful segments, typically sentences or short paragraphs, rather than fixed textual units, in order to preserve contextual meaning.

Based on this first cycle, a provisional codebook was developed that specified code names, operational definitions, inclusion and exclusion rules, and exemplar quotations. The codebook was refined through a pilot coding phase in which two researchers independently coded a stratified sample comprising approximately 20 percent of the corpus. Discrepancies were discussed in calibration meetings and resolved through consensus, leading to clarification, merging, or subdivision of codes where necessary. Although reflexive thematic analysis does not treat intercoder reliability as a prerequisite for validity, reporting calibration outcomes and agreement statistics is recommended in policy-oriented qualitative research to demonstrate analytic rigor and code clarity.¹⁷

The finalized codebook was applied to the whole corpus by the primary coder, with ongoing peer debriefing to support reflexivity and theoretical sensitivity. Codes were subsequently examined for patterns of co-occurrence and conceptual relatedness, and grouped into higher-order themes that captured recurring ways in which values were named, embedded in learning outcomes, linked to pedagogy, or translated into assessment practices. Throughout this process, analytic decisions were documented in an audit trail and supported by reflexive memos, enabling traceability from raw text to reported themes and ensuring credibility, dependability, and confirmability of the findings.¹⁸

Inter-Coder Reliability

Although reflexive thematic analysis foregrounds researcher reflexivity rather than statistical reproducibility, documenting intercoder calibration is increasingly expected in policy-oriented qualitative studies to demonstrate code clarity and analytic transparency.¹⁹ Accordingly, intercoder reliability was assessed during a pilot phase in which two researchers independently coded approximately 20 percent of the corpus, stratified by document type (policy framework, subject curriculum, and guidance materials). Coding units consisted of semantically meaningful text segments. Agreement was evaluated using both raw percentage agreement and Cohen's kappa (κ), with κ values of 0.60 or higher interpreted as indicating acceptable agreement for exploratory qualitative research. Rather than treating reliability coefficients as measures of validity, they were used diagnostically to identify ambiguous code definitions and overlapping conceptual boundaries.

¹⁷ Cliodhna O'Connor and Helene Joffe, "Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Research: Debates and Practical Guidelines," *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 19 (January 1, 2020), <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406919899220>; Braun and Clarke, "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?"

¹⁸ Yvonna S. Lincoln, Egon G. Guba, and Joseph J. Pilotta, "Naturalistic Inquiry," *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 9, no. 4 (January 1985): 438–39, [https://doi.org/10.1016/0147-1767\(85\)90062-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0147-1767(85)90062-8).

¹⁹ Braun and Clarke, "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?"; O'Connor and Joffe, "Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Research: Debates and Practical Guidelines."

Disagreements were addressed through structured calibration meetings in which coders compared interpretations, revisited original text segments, and refined code definitions or inclusion rules as necessary. Where persistent disagreement occurred, codes were either merged or subdivided to improve conceptual precision, and all such decisions were documented in the audit trail. This consensus-based approach aligns with contemporary guidance that emphasizes analytic dialogue and reflexivity over mechanical reliability thresholds, while still providing readers with transparent evidence of coding rigor.²⁰ Final coding of the whole corpus was conducted using the revised codebook, and summary reliability statistics are reported in [Appendix B](#).

All documents and analytic materials were managed using a structured digital workflow designed to ensure traceability and data security. Original documents were downloaded from official MoNE and TYMM websites and archived as date-stamped PDF files with unique document identifiers corresponding to the corpus inventory ([Appendix A](#)). Qualitative coding and data management were conducted using NVivo 14, which facilitated systematic coding, code co-occurrence queries, and the generation of analytic matrices and reports. NVivo project files were backed up regularly and stored alongside exported coding reports to preserve analytic provenance.

Analytic memos, codebook versions, intercoder calibration logs, and audit trail records were maintained as separate, dated files and linked to NVivo outputs through document identifiers. This file-management strategy supports methodological transparency and aligns with recommended practices for qualitative data management and reproducibility in document-based research.²¹ In accordance with publisher policies and copyright restrictions, full-text documents are not redistributed; however, extracted coded segments, codebooks, and analytic logs can be made available to readers.

Reporting and Outputs

The reporting of findings followed established standards for qualitative transparency and rigor in document-based research. Results are presented through an integrated narrative supported by summary tables, thematic maps, and illustrative textual excerpts drawn directly from the analyzed curriculum documents. Higher-order themes are reported with clear links to their constituent codes, and representative quotations are provided to demonstrate how interpretations are grounded in the primary texts. To enhance traceability, each excerpt is referenced by document ID and page number, allowing readers to verify analytic claims against the sources.²² Supplementary materials accompany the main manuscript to support reproducibility, including a complete corpus inventory ([Appendix A](#)), the finalized codebook with intercoder reliability statistics ([Appendix B](#)), and a detailed audit trail with analytic

²⁰ Kason Ka Ching Cheung and Kevin W. H. Tai, "The Use of Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Interview Data Analysis in Science Education," *Research in Science & Technological Education* 41, no. 3 (July 3, 2023): 1155–75, <https://doi.org/10.1080/02635143.2021.1993179>; O'Connor and Joffe, "Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Research: Debates and Practical Guidelines."

²¹ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach."

²² Bowen, "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method"; Braun and Clarke, "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?"

memos documenting key methodological decisions ([Appendix C](#)). Consistent with recommendations for qualitative policy research, these appendices are designed to make the analytic process visible without overburdening the main text, thereby balancing methodological transparency with readability.²³ A data availability statement specifies which analytic artifacts (e.g., coded excerpts, codebook, and audit logs) can be shared upon reasonable request, subject to copyright and publisher restrictions, further reinforcing the study's credibility, dependability, and confirmability.²⁴

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

This section presents the findings of the qualitative document analysis in a descriptive manner. The results are organized into (1) the main themes identified across the TYMM primary-education corpus, (2) a cross-document mapping of core values, and (3) representative textual excerpts illustrating each theme. No interpretive or evaluative analysis is provided in this section.

Main Themes

Table 1 summarizes six main themes identified in the analysis of the TYMM document corpus related to the presentation of values education. The themes capture how values are represented across different types of documents, including explicit references to named values and virtues, the use of competency-based and outcome-oriented language, and the provision of pedagogical guidance. The table also reflects references to values within assessment frameworks, instances of values embedded implicitly in broader discursive statements, and system-level references related to implementation, such as teacher professional development and school-wide planning. These themes describe the different ways values education is documented and structured within the corpus.

Table 1. Main Themes in the Representation of Values Education in TYMM Document Corpus

No.	Main Theme	Description
1	Explicitly named values and virtues	Values and virtues are explicitly stated and, in some cases, defined. These explicit references appear in the Common Text, student profile descriptions, curriculum frameworks, and guidance documents.
2	Values framed as competencies and learning outcomes	Values are frequently articulated using competency-based or outcome-oriented language. They are expressed through action verbs and observable behaviors within learning outcomes or competency statements.
3	Pedagogical guidance for values education	Several documents provide guidance on instructional strategies and learning activities intended to support the development of values, ranging from general recommendations to specific classroom- or school-based activities.
4	Assessment-related references to values	References to the assessment of values appear in assessment frameworks and guidance documents, including behavioral indicators, observation criteria, and reflective tasks linked to value-related learning outcomes.

²³ Dalglish, Khalid, and McMahon, "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach."

²⁴ Lincoln, Guba, and Pilotta, "Naturalistic Inquiry."

5	Implicit and discursive value framing	Some values are not explicitly named but are embedded within aspirational descriptions of student profiles, institutional goals, or broader discursive statements related to identity, citizenship, or social participation.
6	System-level and implementation-oriented references	Values education is also addressed at the system level through references to teacher professional development, school-wide planning, and co-curricular or extracurricular structures.

Cross-Document Mapping

Table 2 presents a mapping of selected core values across the primary documents included in the analytic corpus (D1–D10). An “X” indicates that the value was identified at least once in the corresponding document during coding.

Table 2. Presence of core values across TYMM documents

Value / Document ID	D1	D2	D3	D4	D5	D6	D7	D8	D9	D10	Total
Honesty	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Respect	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Responsibility	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Empathy / Compassion	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Cooperation / Teamwork	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Self-discipline / Self-regulation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Civic or social responsibility	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	X	10
Patriotism / National identity	X	X		X		X	X			X	6
Critical thinking / Reflection	X	X	X	X		X			X		6

Note: Presence indicates at least one coded occurrence in the document. Absence indicates that the value was not explicitly named or operationalized in that document.

Textual Evidence

The following translated excerpts illustrate how values are represented in the corpus. Original-language (Türkiye) excerpts and whole contextual passages are provided in the appendices.

Table 3. Illustrative textual evidence of value representation in TYMM document corpus

No.	Category of Value Representation	Illustrative Textual Evidence
1	Explicitly named values	<i>“The curriculum is based on core values such as honesty, respect, responsibility, and cooperation, which guide educational practices.”</i>
2	Values as competencies and learning outcomes	<i>“Students demonstrate empathy by considering others’ feelings and responding appropriately during group activities.”</i>
3	Pedagogical guidance	<i>“Role-playing activities and collaborative projects are recommended to support the development of cooperation and responsibility.”</i>
4	Assessment-related references	<i>“Teachers observe students’ cooperative behaviors using checklists and reflective evaluation tools.”</i>
5	Implicit value framing	<i>“The student profile emphasizes individuals who contribute positively to society and uphold shared values.”</i>
6	System-level references	<i>“In-service training programs include modules focused on integrating values into lesson planning and school culture.”</i>

Table 3 presents illustrative textual evidence of different ways values are represented in the analyzed corpus. The first category, explicitly named values, is exemplified by statements that directly list specific values and position them as foundational elements guiding educational practices. The second category, values as competencies and learning

outcomes, is illustrated through descriptions of student behaviors that reflect values within observable learning activities. Pedagogical guidance is represented by excerpts that describe recommended instructional strategies and learning activities intended to support the development of particular values. Assessment-related references appear in statements that describe how value-related behaviors are observed and documented using specific assessment tools. Implicit value framing is shown through broader descriptions of student profiles that embed values within aspirational characteristics rather than naming them directly. Finally, system-level references are illustrated by excerpts that describe how values education is addressed through institutional structures, such as in-service training programs and school-wide practices.

Discussion

Document analysis reveals that values occupy an explicit and recurrent place in the Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM) primary-education texts: values are named, frequently expressed as observable competencies or learning outcomes, and various documents include guidance on classroom activities and assessment instruments intended to register value-related behaviours. This pattern, naming values, converting them into competency language, and providing teacher-oriented guidance, aligns with a broader international trend toward contemporary curricula that make values and attitudes a declarative part of intended learning while seeking ways to translate them into teachable and assessable forms.²⁵ Policy syntheses and comparative reviews show that many systems now aim to embed values and attitudes as part of “*what students should know, do, and be,*” while recognising the normative and contested nature of such curricular choices.²⁶

The framing of values as competencies and the presence of assessment guidance in TYMM reflect the same alignment challenge identified in the assessment literature: translating complex socio-emotional and moral constructs into valid, reliable, and actionable assessment evidence is difficult and requires careful design.²⁷ International assessment scholarship increasingly argues for “next-generation” approaches, such as extended performance tasks, authentic contexts, multimodal evidence, and new measurement models, when systems attempt to assess 21st-century competencies and values.²⁸ These approaches demand substantial intellectual, technical, and fiscal investment, including psychometric development, task design, and validation studies, to ensure that assessment practices do not

²⁵ OECD, *Embedding Values and Attitudes in Curriculum*.

²⁶ OECD.

²⁷ Narelle English et al., “Rubrics and Formative Assessment in K-12 Education: A Scoping Review of Literature,” *International Journal of Educational Research* 113 (2022): 101964, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2022.101964>; Nerea Martinez-Yarza, Rosa Santibáñez, and Josu Solabarrieta, “A Systematic Review of Instruments Measuring Social and Emotional Skills in School-Aged Children and Adolescents,” *Child Indicators Research* 16, no. 4 (August 19, 2023): 1475–1502, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12187-023-10031-3>.

²⁸ OECD, *Innovating Assessments to Measure and Support Complex Skills* (OECD Publishing, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.1787/e5f3e341-en>; Zachari Swiecki et al., “Assessment in the Age of Artificial Intelligence,” *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence* 3 (2022): 100075, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeai.2022.100075>; Leonora Kaldaras, Hope O. Akaeze, and Mark D. Reckase, “Developing Valid Assessments in the Era of Generative Artificial Intelligence,” *Frontiers in Education* 9 (August 7, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2024.1399377>.

distort the constructs they intend to measure.²⁹ The TYMM corpus's preference for observational instruments, rubric-style scoring, and reflective tasks is consistent with formative and classroom-level strategies recommended in the literature.³⁰ Although scaling such approaches beyond pilot contexts raises well-documented challenges.

Evidence from systematic and meta-analytic studies of character and values education provides further context for interpreting the corpus. Programmes that explicitly target character or values tend to yield small but often meaningful positive effects on pro-social behaviour and related outcomes, with considerable variation across programme types, duration, implementation quality, and research design.³¹ Meta-analytic findings also highlight that mentoring-based interventions, brief targeted programmes, and well-implemented initiatives may demonstrate comparatively larger effects. At the same time, methodological limitations and selection biases remain common across the evidence base.³² These empirical patterns suggest caution when extrapolating policy-level claims about the ease or speed with which curricular language translates into measurable student-level change, as implementation quality, monitoring, and evaluation design strongly influence outcomes.

Implementation research on competency-framed reforms underscores several points relevant to the TYMM findings. Competency-based or outcome-oriented curriculum reforms frequently encounter gaps between policy intent and classroom practice, as teachers face practical constraints related to time, assessment demands, and material resources, and as system-level dynamics complicate coherent enactment.³³ From this perspective, the inclusion of teacher guidance, professional development references, and whole-school planning documents in the TYMM corpus constitutes a procedural strength. However, existing evidence suggests that such supports are necessary, but not sufficient, for consistent implementation. Empirical studies of competency-based reforms repeatedly emphasise the importance of sustained support, contextual adaptation, and investment in teacher assessment literacy to realise policy aims in practice.³⁴

From a policy and practice perspective, the cross-document patterns in the TYMM corpus point to several actionable priorities supported by international evidence. Alignment across curriculum statements, pedagogical guidance, and assessment instruments should be made explicit through clear construct definitions, learning progressions, and shared exemplars.³⁵ Investment in teacher professional development should prioritise assessment

²⁹ OECD, *Innovating Assessments to Measure and Support Complex Skills*; Kaldaras, Akaze, and Reckase, "Developing Valid Assessments in the Era of Generative Artificial Intelligence."

³⁰ English et al., "Rubrics and Formative Assessment in K-12 Education: A Scoping Review of Literature"; Gina Pancorbo et al., "Formative Assessment of Social-Emotional Skills Using Rubrics: A Review of Knowns and Unknowns," *Frontiers in Education* 6 (November 17, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2021.687661>.

³¹ Mitch Brown et al., "A Comprehensive Meta-Analysis of Character Education Programs," *Journal of Moral Education* 52, no. 2 (April 3, 2023): 119–38, <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2022.2060196>.

³² Brown et al.

³³ Janssens et al., "When Theory Beats Practice: The Implementation of Competency-Based Education at Healthcare Workplaces."

³⁴ Janssens et al.; Serafina Pastore, "Teacher Assessment Literacy: A Systematic Review," *Frontiers in Education* 8 (July 6, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2023.1217167>.

³⁵ English et al., "Rubrics and Formative Assessment in K-12 Education: A Scoping Review of Literature"; Pancorbo et al., "Formative Assessment of Social-Emotional Skills Using Rubrics: A Review of Knowns and Unknowns."

literacy for value-related outcomes, including the reliable use of rubrics and observational tools, supported by calibration and moderation processes.³⁶ Given the technical complexity of assessing integrated competencies and values at scale, phased piloting and validation studies are recommended prior to high-stakes use, drawing on principles of authentic and next-generation assessment design.³⁷ Finally, ongoing monitoring and mixed-methods research—including attention to cross-cultural measurement equivalence where relevant—are needed to examine fidelity, adaptation, and student experience during implementation,³⁸ recognising that embedding values in curriculum texts is a necessary but insufficient condition for producing reliable, equitable, and pedagogically coherent outcomes.

Given the technical complexity of assessing integrated competencies and values at scale, phased piloting and validation studies are recommended before large-scale accountability uses are adopted.³⁹ Next-generation assessment design principles (authentic tasks, multimodal evidence, and careful validation) provide a roadmap for piloting but also require multi-stakeholder collaboration (assessment experts, domain specialists, teachers, and policymakers) and sustained resourcing.⁴⁰ Fourth, because the corpus contains both universal moral language (e.g., honesty, respect) and nation-framed language (e.g., civic commitment, national identity), policymakers should explicitly consider how to balance culturally specific aims with internationally recognised competencies, clarifying whether some value statements are primarily civic-formation goals, school-culture aspirations, or curricular learning outcomes subject to assessment.⁴¹ Finally, monitoring and research should accompany rollout: mixed-methods implementation studies (observations, teacher interviews, and outcome measurement) will be essential to understand fidelity, adaptation, and student experience.⁴²

Limitations and directions for further research are straightforward. The present analysis is document-based and cannot alone establish how teachers interpret or enact the TYMM texts; classroom ethnography, teacher survey research, and pilot assessment studies are

³⁶ Pastore, "Teacher Assessment Literacy: A Systematic Review."

³⁷ OECD, *Innovating Assessments to Measure and Support Complex Skills*; Swiecki et al., "Assessment in the Age of Artificial Intelligence"; Kaldaras, Akaeze, and Reckase, "Developing Valid Assessments in the Era of Generative Artificial Intelligence."

³⁸ Juyeon Lee and Alvin Junus, "Differences and Similarities in Youth Social-Emotional Competence Measurement Between North American and East Asian Countries: Exploratory Graph Analysis Using the OECD Survey on Social and Emotional Skills Data," *Child Indicators Research* 17, no. 1 (February 23, 2024): 57–79, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12187-023-10074-6>.

³⁹ Nina Charlotte Johanna Welsandt et al., "Constructing and Validating Authentic Assessments: The Case of a New Technology-Based Assessment of Economic Literacy," *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training* 16, no. 1 (April 10, 2024): 4, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40461-024-00158-0>; Kaldaras, Akaeze, and Reckase, "Developing Valid Assessments in the Era of Generative Artificial Intelligence."

⁴⁰ Dimitrios Vlachopoulos and Agoritsa Makri, "A Systematic Literature Review on Authentic Assessment in Higher Education: Best Practices for the Development of 21st Century Skills, and Policy Considerations," *Studies in Educational Evaluation* 83 (December 2024): 101425, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2024.101425>.

⁴¹ Francisco Leonardo Soler-Anguiano, Sofia Rivera-Aragón, and Rolando Díaz-Loving, "Cross-Cultural Measurement Invariance Evidence of Individualism and Collectivism: From the Idiosyncratic to Universal," *Frontiers in Psychology* 14 (September 27, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2023.1150757>.

⁴² Andria B. Eisman et al., "A Mixed Methods Investigation of Implementation Determinants for a School-Based Universal Prevention Intervention," *Implementation Research and Practice* 3 (January 23, 2022), <https://doi.org/10.1177/26334895221124962>; Vlachopoulos and Makri, "A Systematic Literature Review on Authentic Assessment in Higher Education: Best Practices for the Development of 21st Century Skills, and Policy Considerations."

required to triangulate the policy texts with practice.⁴³ In addition, assessment development and validation for value-related constructs should be prioritised, using iterative task design, inter-rater calibration, and psychometric analyses where feasible.⁴⁴ Comparative research with jurisdictions that have piloted rubric-based or performance assessments for socio-emotional and civic outcomes may yield practical design lessons and help anticipate unintended consequences.⁴⁵ Taken together, the document findings, international evidence, and implementation literature indicate that embedding values in curriculum texts is necessary but must be accompanied by a multi-pronged implementation strategy to produce reliable, equitable, and pedagogically coherent outcomes.⁴⁶

CONCLUSION

This document-based analysis of the Türkiye Century Maarif Model (TYMM) for primary education demonstrates that values education is explicitly and structurally embedded in the curriculum. Core moral and social values are not only named as normative principles but are frequently articulated as competencies and learning outcomes linked to observable behaviours, pedagogical guidance, and references to assessment practices. In addition, the TYMM documents address system-level supports, including teacher professional development and school-based planning, indicating that values education is framed as an institutional responsibility rather than an individual instructional choice. Taken together, these findings suggest that TYMM adopts a curriculum approach that integrates values coherently across learning objectives, teaching practices, and evaluation frameworks at the primary level.

Several limitations should be considered when interpreting these findings. First, the study relies exclusively on document analysis. It therefore cannot determine how curriculum texts are interpreted or enacted in classroom practice, nor can it determine their effects on students' value development. Second, the corpus is limited to documents published during the TYMM drafting and early implementation period (2023–early 2025), and subsequent revisions or supplementary materials are not included. Third, although the analysis was

⁴³ Marie-Therese Schultes, "An Introduction to Implementation Evaluation of School-Based Interventions," *European Journal of Developmental Psychology* 20, no. 1 (January 2, 2023): 189–201, <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405629.2021.1976633>; Janssens et al., "When Theory Beats Practice: The Implementation of Competency-Based Education at Healthcare Workplaces"; Justin D. Smith, Dennis H. Li, and Miriam R. Rafferty, "The Implementation Research Logic Model: A Method for Planning, Executing, Reporting, and Synthesizing Implementation Projects," *Implementation Science* 15, no. 1 (December 25, 2020): 84, <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13012-020-01041-8>.

⁴⁴ Gina Pancorbo et al., "Decomposing Social-Emotional Skill Rubrics: A Methodological Approach to Examining Acquiescence in Rubrics' Ratings," *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice* 30, no. 5–6 (November 2, 2023): 429–47, <https://doi.org/10.1080/0969594X.2023.2271679>; Martinez-Yarza, Santibáñez, and Solabarrieta, "A Systematic Review of Instruments Measuring Social and Emotional Skills in School-Aged Children and Adolescents"; Dong-Mi Yoo and Jae Jin Han, "Inter-Rater Reliability and Content Validity of the Measurement Tool for Portfolio Assessments Used in the Introduction to Clinical Medicine Course at Ewha Womans University College of Medicine: A Methodological Study," *Journal of Educational Evaluation for Health Professions* 21 (December 10, 2024): 39, <https://doi.org/10.3352/jeehp.2024.21.39>.

⁴⁵ Vlachopoulos and Makri, "A Systematic Literature Review on Authentic Assessment in Higher Education: Best Practices for the Development of 21st Century Skills, and Policy Considerations"; Pastore, "Teacher Assessment Literacy: A Systematic Review."

⁴⁶ Schultes, "An Introduction to Implementation Evaluation of School-Based Interventions"; Smith, Li, and Rafferty, "The Implementation Research Logic Model: A Method for Planning, Executing, Reporting, and Synthesizing Implementation Projects."

conducted using original Turkish-language texts, translating selected excerpts into English may entail subtle interpretive shifts despite verification procedures. Fourth, the findings cannot be generalized as evidence of implementation effectiveness without complementary empirical research at the school and classroom levels. Finally, while inclusion decisions were systematically documented, locally produced or non-public materials related to values education may contain relevant information not captured in the official corpus.

The findings point to several actionable implications for policy and practice. Curriculum developers should articulate clear operational definitions for each stated value, specifying observable indicators and expected developmental progression across grade levels. Learning progressions for values education support coherence and consistency in implementation. Assessment practices should be strengthened by developing annotated rubrics and exemplar student work to facilitate shared understanding and calibration among teachers. Teacher professional development should prioritize assessment literacy related to values, including observation, rubric use, moderation, and formative feedback. Prior to large-scale or high-stakes use, value-related assessment instruments should be piloted and empirically validated. At the school level, alignment between curriculum policy and practice can be enhanced through school-based action plans that integrate curricular, co-curricular, and cultural initiatives. Finally, future research employing mixed-methods designs is necessary to examine implementation fidelity, local adaptation, and early outcomes of values education under the TYMM framework.

REFERENCES

- Alvero, John Clifford. "Empowering Future Global Citizens: An Integrated GCED Framework for Enhancing Cognitive, Socio-Emotional, and Behavioral Domains in Philippine Higher Education." *Journal of Interdisciplinary Perspectives* 3, no. 9 (2025): 383–90. <https://doi.org/10.69569/jip.2025.564>.
- Aybek, Birsal, and Osman Oğuz. "Sustainable and Inclusive Education Reform in Türkiye: A CIPP Evaluation of the Primary Turkish Language Curriculum." *Sustainability* 17, no. 19 (September 26, 2025): 8659. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su17198659>.
- Bosio, Emiliano, and Hans Schattle. "Ethical Global Citizenship Education: From Neoliberalism to a Values-Based Pedagogy." *PROSPECTS* 53, no. 3–4 (November 24, 2023): 287–97. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11125-021-09571-9>.
- Bowen, Glenn A. "Document Analysis as a Qualitative Research Method." *Qualitative Research Journal* 9, no. 2 (August 3, 2009): 27–40. <https://doi.org/10.3316/QRJ0902027>.
- Braun, Virginia, and Victoria Clarke. "One Size Fits All? What Counts as Quality Practice in (Reflexive) Thematic Analysis?" *Qualitative Research in Psychology* 18, no. 3 (July 3, 2021): 328–52. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14780887.2020.1769238>.
- Brown, Mitch, Robert E. McGrath, Melinda C. Bier, Keith Johnson, and Marvin W. Berkowitz. "A Comprehensive Meta-Analysis of Character Education Programs." *Journal of Moral Education* 52, no. 2 (April 3, 2023): 119–38. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2022.2060196>.

- Can, Dila. "New Education Program in Values Education: Türkiye Century Maarif Model." In *PUPIL: International Journal of Teaching, Education and Learning Current Archives About*, 281–87. Global Research & Development Services Publishing, 2025. <https://doi.org/10.20319/ictel.2025.281287>.
- Cheung, Kason Ka Ching, and Kevin W. H. Tai. "The Use of Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Interview Data Analysis in Science Education." *Research in Science & Technological Education* 41, no. 3 (July 3, 2023): 1155–75. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02635143.2021.1993179>.
- Chung, Ming-Lun, and Ken Ka-Wo Fung. "A New Paradigm of Moral Education and Civic Engagement? A Sociological Institutional Interpretation of Multiculturalism among Taiwanese Youth." *Journal of Moral Education* 53, no. 4 (October 12, 2024): 717–42. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2024.2354964>.
- DalGLISH, Sarah L, Hina Khalid, and Shannon A McMahon. "Document Analysis in Health Policy Research: The READ Approach." *Health Policy and Planning* 35, no. 10 (February 16, 2021): 1424–31. <https://doi.org/10.1093/heapol/czaa064>.
- Eisman, Andria B., Lawrence A. Palinkas, Suzanne Brown, Leslie Lundahl, and Amy M. Kilbourne. "A Mixed Methods Investigation of Implementation Determinants for a School-Based Universal Prevention Intervention." *Implementation Research and Practice* 3 (January 23, 2022). <https://doi.org/10.1177/26334895221124962>.
- English, Narelle, Pam Robertson, Shelley Gillis, and Lorraine Graham. "Rubrics and Formative Assessment in K-12 Education: A Scoping Review of Literature." *International Journal of Educational Research* 113 (2022): 101964. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijer.2022.101964>.
- Jacobson, Dan. "Naturalistic Inquiry." In *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, 75:267–72. London: Elsevier, 2020. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-102295-5.10579-7>.
- Janssens, Oona, Mieke Embo, Martin Valcke, and Leen Haerens. "When Theory Beats Practice: The Implementation of Competency-Based Education at Healthcare Workplaces." *BMC Medical Education* 23, no. 1 (June 29, 2023): 484. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-023-04446-3>.
- Kaldaras, Leonora, Hope O. Akaeze, and Mark D. Reckase. "Developing Valid Assessments in the Era of Generative Artificial Intelligence." *Frontiers in Education* 9 (August 7, 2024). <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2024.1399377>.
- Lee, Juyeon, and Alvin Junus. "Differences and Similarities in Youth Social-Emotional Competence Measurement Between North American and East Asian Countries: Exploratory Graph Analysis Using the OECD Survey on Social and Emotional Skills Data." *Child Indicators Research* 17, no. 1 (February 23, 2024): 57–79. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12187-023-10074-6>.
- Lincoln, Yvonna S., Egon G. Guba, and Joseph J. Pilotta. "Naturalistic Inquiry." *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 9, no. 4 (January 1985): 438–39. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0147-1767\(85\)90062-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/0147-1767(85)90062-8).
- Marcotte, Kayla M., and Larry D. Gruppen. "Competency-Based Education as Curriculum and

- Assessment for Integrative Learning.” *Education Sciences* 12, no. 4 (April 11, 2022): 267. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci12040267>.
- Martinez-Yarza, Nerea, Rosa Santibáñez, and Josu Solabarrieta. “A Systematic Review of Instruments Measuring Social and Emotional Skills in School-Aged Children and Adolescents.” *Child Indicators Research* 16, no. 4 (August 19, 2023): 1475–1502. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12187-023-10031-3>.
- O’Connor, Cliodhna, and Helene Joffe. “Intercoder Reliability in Qualitative Research: Debates and Practical Guidelines.” *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 19 (January 1, 2020). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406919899220>.
- OECD. *Embedding Values and Attitudes in Curriculum*. OECD Publishing, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.1787/ae2adcd-en>.
- OECD. *Innovating Assessments to Measure and Support Complex Skills*. OECD Publishing, 2023. <https://doi.org/10.1787/e5f3e341-en>.
- Pancorbo, Gina, Ricardo Primi, Oliver P. John, Daniel Santos, and Filip De Fruyt. “Decomposing Social-Emotional Skill Rubrics: A Methodological Approach to Examining Acquiescence in Rubrics’ Ratings.” *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice* 30, no. 5–6 (November 2, 2023): 429–47. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0969594X.2023.2271679>.
- Pancorbo, Gina, Ricardo Primi, Oliver P. John, Daniel Santos, and Filip De Fruyt. “Formative Assessment of Social-Emotional Skills Using Rubrics: A Review of Knowns and Unknowns.” *Frontiers in Education* 6 (November 17, 2021). <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2021.687661>.
- Pastore, Serafina. “Teacher Assessment Literacy: A Systematic Review.” *Frontiers in Education* 8 (July 6, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2023.1217167>.
- Schultes, Marie-Therese. “An Introduction to Implementation Evaluation of School-Based Interventions.” *European Journal of Developmental Psychology* 20, no. 1 (January 2, 2023): 189–201. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17405629.2021.1976633>.
- Smith, Justin D., Dennis H. Li, and Miriam R. Rafferty. “The Implementation Research Logic Model: A Method for Planning, Executing, Reporting, and Synthesizing Implementation Projects.” *Implementation Science* 15, no. 1 (December 25, 2020): 84. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13012-020-01041-8>.
- Soler-Anguiano, Francisco Leonardo, Sofía Rivera-Aragón, and Rolando Díaz-Loving. “Cross-Cultural Measurement Invariance Evidence of Individualism and Collectivism: From the Idiosyncratic to Universal.” *Frontiers in Psychology* 14 (September 27, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2023.1150757>.
- Swiecki, Zachari, Hassan Khosravi, Guanliang Chen, Roberto Martinez-Maldonado, Jason M. Lodge, Sandra Milligan, Neil Selwyn, and Dragan Gašević. “Assessment in the Age of Artificial Intelligence.” *Computers and Education: Artificial Intelligence* 3 (2022): 100075. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.caeai.2022.100075>.
- Vlachopoulos, Dimitrios, and Agoritsa Makri. “A Systematic Literature Review on Authentic Assessment in Higher Education: Best Practices for the Development of 21st Century Skills, and Policy Considerations.” *Studies in Educational Evaluation* 83 (December 2024):

101425. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2024.101425>.

Welsandt, Nina Charlotte Johanna, Fabio Fortunati, Esther Winther, and Hermann Josef Abs.

“Constructing and Validating Authentic Assessments: The Case of a New Technology-Based Assessment of Economic Literacy.” *Empirical Research in Vocational Education and Training* 16, no. 1 (April 10, 2024): 4. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40461-024-00158-0>.

Yoo, Dong-Mi, and Jae Jin Han. “Inter-Rater Reliability and Content Validity of the Measurement Tool for Portfolio Assessments Used in the Introduction to Clinical Medicine Course at Ewha Womans University College of Medicine: A Methodological Study.” *Journal of Educational Evaluation for Health Professions* 21 (December 10, 2024): 39. <https://doi.org/10.3352/jeehp.2024.21.39>.